

# Minutes

of a meeting of the

## Planning Committee

held on Wednesday, 23 March 2016 at 6.30 pm  
in the The Ridgeway, The Beacon, Portway,  
Wantage, OX12 9BY



**Open to the public, including the press**

### **Present:**

Members: Councillors Robert Sharp (Chairman), Eric Batts, Roger Cox, Stuart Davenport, Jenny Hannaby, Anthony Hayward, Bob Johnston, Judy Roberts and Chris McCarthy

Officers: Peter Brampton, Charlotte Brewerton Katie Cook, Adrian Duffield, Sarah Green, Laura Hudson, Brett Leahy, Nicola Meurer, Cathie Scotting and Penny Silverwood

Also present: Councillors Debby Hallett and Reg Waite

Number of members of the public: 26

### **PI.284 Chairman's announcements**

The chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting, outlined the procedure to be followed and advise on emergency evacuation arrangements.

### **PI.285 Notification of substitutes and apologies for absence**

Councillors Catherine Webber, Sandy Lovatt and Janet Shelley tendered their apologies; Councillor Judy Roberts substituted (for Councillor Webber).

### **PI.286 Declarations of pecuniary interests and other declarations**

Councillors Robert Sharp, Roger Cox, Eric Batts and Bob Johnston declared that they would step down for item 9: P13/V2428/FUL – 34 North Hinksey Lane, Oxford.

### **PI.287 Minutes**

**RESOLVED:** to adopt the minutes of the committee held on 2 March 2016 and agree that the chairman sign them as a correct record.

### **PI.288 Urgent business**

None.

## **PI.289 Statements and petitions from the public on planning applications**

The list showing 12 members of the public that had registered to speak on planning applications was tabled at the meeting.

## **PI.290 Statements, petitions and questions from the public on other matters**

None.

## **PI.291 Materials**

**RESOLVED:** to approve the following materials for application P15/V2175/FUL – Land west of nursery, Steventon Road, East Hanney:

- Bricks – Terca “Bellbrook”, The Bespoke Brick Company “Baccara” and Ibstock “Shire Autumn Russet”.
- Tiles – Redland “Heathland Elizabethan 26”, Redland “Duoplain Rustic Black 45” and Siga 37 “Natural slate black”.
- Render – Semi-sharp cement render cream finish.
- Cladding – Hardie Plank Chestnut Brown Cedar Texture.

**RESOLVED:** to approve the following materials for application P10/V1907/O - land south of Appleford Road, Sutton Courtenay:

- Brick type 1 – Forterra Cheshire red multi brick
- Brick type 2 – Forterra Worcestershire red multi brick

## **PI.292 P13/V2428/FUL - 34 North Hinksey Lane, Oxford**

Councillors Eric Batts, Bob Johnston, Roger Cox and Robert Sharp stepped down from the committee and took no part in the consideration or voting on this item.

Members voted in Councillor Stuart Davenport to act as Chairman for this item.

The officer presented the report and addendum on application P13/V2428/FUL to demolish the existing building and erect seven new dwellings comprising two x 3-bed two storey dwellings; five x 2-bed flats within a three storey building; new access from North Hinksey Lane; 14 car parking spaces; cycle parking spaces; refuse storage and landscaping at 34 Hinksey Lane, Oxford.

Officer update: A correction in paragraph 6.21 of the report, which refers to the depth of the proposed block of flats being 11.19m. However it would be 13.8m in the middle of the block. In the list of relevant polices at 5.1 of the report, it should include H10 – Development in the five main settlements.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Philip Booth, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application. His concerns included the following:

- Undermines the character and integrity of the area;
- The proposal is overdeveloped, overcrowded, cramped and bulky;
- Flat roofs don't fit in;
- Low standard of amenity space;
- Light and noise pollution; and
- Bulky balconies still allow overlooking.

Peter Uzzell, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application. His speech included the following:

- There has been a positive response to the reduction in size and number of units since the last application;
- The redesigned balconies further reduce peripheral views;
- Fits in comfortably;
- Improved relationship with neighbouring properties, reflecting existing pattern of development;
- Sustainable location;
- Contemporary design not out of place, it is not near a conservation area nor near any historic buildings; and
- Widens housing range in area, contributing to five year land supply.

Councillor Debby Hallett, one of the local ward members, spoke objecting to the application. Her concerns included the following:

- Significant harm demonstrably outweighs the benefits;
- Overdevelopment of the site;
- Average nine dwellings per hectare in the area, this proposal is 42 dwellings per hectare;
- No strong justification for flat roofs;
- Height and location of apartments is only achieved by sinking them into the ground, creating gloomy interiors;
- Overlooking, light intrusion due to steeply rising driveway;
- Lack of amenity space; and
- Not in character with the area.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate; the discussion included the following points:

- Squeezing as many units in as possible;
- Design guide hasn't been complied with;
- Significantly different from the character of the area;
- Effects on neighbouring properties – loss of light and overlooking;
- Concern for number of vehicle movements required to extract soil; and
- Lack of garden space.

The committee did not agree that the proposal would not have a negative impact on the character of the area; or that the design was in line with policy.

A motion, moved and seconded to approve the application was lost on being put to the vote.

A motion, moved and seconded to refuse the application was declared carried on being put to the vote.

**RESOLVED:** (5 votes to nil)

To refuse planning permission for application P13/V2428/FUL, for the following reasons:

The proposal fails to demonstrate a high quality design that would satisfactorily integrate into its surroundings. This part of North Hinksey is characterised by low density residential plots in spacious gardens on the edge of the village. The design of the proposed development including the scale, bulk, mass, built form and site coverage would detract from the existing character resulting in significant and demonstrable harm to the local distinctiveness and character of the area. The amount of development and extent of hard form and surfaces are an overdevelopment of the site, demonstrated by the limited scope for landscaping, the diminished amenity to the adjoining neighbouring properties (visual obtrusion, loss of privacy, noise and light intrusion) and the lack of amenity afforded to new residents (amenity space and living conditions).

In accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework the Council gives great importance to the design of the built environment. As such the proposal is contrary to the NPPF (paragraphs 17(4), 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61 and 64 in particular), Policies DC1, DC6 and DC9 of the adopted Local Plan, the adopted Vale of White Horse Design Guide March 2015 and Policy 37 of the emerging draft Local Plan 2031.

### **PI.293 P15/V2117/FUL - 47 West Way, Botley**

The officer presented the report and addendum on application P15/V2117/FUL to demolish the existing commercial building and develop eleven apartments in two three-storey buildings at 47 West Way, Botley.

Following further representation from the highways authority, condition 15 has been amended to reflect their request to relocating the turning head for larger delivery vehicles.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Adrian James, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application. His speech included the following:

- Successfully addressed the objections;
- Access right across the forecourt will be retained;
- Amenity space is less in urban areas, however all properties will have south-facing terraces; and
- Sits comfortably in wider context of the area.

Councillor Debby Hallett, one of the local ward members, spoke objecting to the application. Her concerns included the following:

- Reduced car parking allocation;
- Out of character with the surrounding area;
- Unsafe due to the busy road; and
- Not high quality design.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate; the discussion covered the following points:

- Highways have accepted car parking provision;
- “Buyer beware” – and individual choice in living there;
- Surrounded by employment centre;
- Amenity spaces are screened;
- Urban design officer is content;
- Air quality concerns, however no objections have been made from environmental health;
- Strengthening of condition relating to drainage to reference the drainage channel at the rear of the site; and
- Concern for safety of cyclists.

**RESOLVED:** (6 for; 3 against)

To authorise the head of planning to grant planning permission for application P15/V2117/FUL, subject to:

1. A S106 agreement being entered into with the district council in order to secure contributions towards local infrastructure; and
2. Conditions as follows:
  1. Commencement within three years.
  2. Approved plans.
  3. Slab levels to be agreed.
  4. Samples of all materials to be agreed.
  5. Details of windows, doors, balconies and rainwater goods to be agreed.
  6. Details of balcony privacy screens to be agreed.
  7. Construction traffic management plan to be agreed.
  8. Travel information pack to be agreed.
  9. Sustainable urban drainage scheme to be agreed.
  10. Foul drainage strategy to be agreed.
  11. Boundary details to be agreed.
  12. Bicycle parking and bin storage to be agreed.
  13. Access as approved.
  14. Parking as approved.
  15. Turning and manoeuvring space to be agreed.
  16. No drainage to highway.

## **PI.294 P15/V2648/FUL - Land off Colton Road, Shrivenham**

The officer presented the report and addendum on application P15/V2648/FUL for a material minor amendment to planning permission P15/V2757/FUL to alter the approved layout to substitute house types and re-plan plots on land off Colton Road, Shrivenham.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site’s planning history were detailed in the officer’s report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

**RESOLVED:** (9 votes to nil)

To authorise the head of planning to grant planning permission for application P15/V2648/FUL, subject to the following conditions:

Vale Of White Horse District Council – Planning Committee Minutes

Wednesday, 23 March 2016

1. A deed of variation to the previous S106 agreement being entered into with the county council in order to secure increased contributions towards expansion of the local primary school; and
2. Conditions as follows:
  1. Commencement within 18 months of original consent (25 August 2015).
  2. Approved plans.
  3. Materials as approved.
  4. Boundary walls and fences as approved.
  5. Removal of permitted development rights for all extensions.
  6. Landscaping as approved.
  7. Development to be accordance with approved arboricultural method statement.
  8. Protection of trees as agreed.
  9. Surface water drainage strategy to be agreed.
  10. Foul water drainage strategy to be agreed.
  11. Implementation of agreed flow and pressure water supply tests.
  12. Implementation of agreed water supply upgrades.
  13. Written scheme of archaeology as agreed.
  14. Programme and record of archaeological work as agreed.
  15. Construction traffic management plan as agreed.
  16. Travel information packs to be agreed.
  17. Access, parking and turning as agreed.
  18. New estate roads as agreed.
  19. Footpaths as agreed.
  20. No surface water drainage to highway.
  21. Wildlife protection and mitigation as agreed.
  22. Obscure glazing for plots 30 and 31.
  23. LEAP details to be agreed.
  24. Fire hydrants as agreed.
  25. Noise attenuation as agreed.
  26. Slab levels as agreed.
  27. Spine road speed controls as agreed.
  28. Permitted development restriction on satellite dishes on apartment block.
  29. Side facing windows in Plot 2 to be agreed.

**PI.295 P15/V2406/FUL & P15/V2407/LB - Owlsote Manor Farm, High Street, Upton, Didcot**

The officer presented the report and addendum on applications P15/V4206/FUL and P15/V2407/LB to remove all non-historic buildings; convert the listed former granary and store at the front of the site to a single dwelling; setting out of gardens to the granary conversion and existing dwelling to remove modern additions; provide access to serve the new dwellings; erect three new dwellings with gardens and garaging; and other associated works at Owlsote Manor Farm, High Street, Upton.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Stuart Fraser, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application. His concerns included the following:

- Too tall for the site;
- Sets a precedent of building into open countryside; and

- Overlooking.

Henry Venners, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application. His speech included the following:

- Current house has been harmed by modern improvements;
- Culvert would benefit the area;
- Owner of Upton Lodge is satisfied;
- Designed to still look like a barn;
- Large separation, so would not dominate.

Councillor Reg Waite, one of the local ward members, spoke on behalf of Upton parish council. His speech included the following:

- Support in general for the application due to restoration of listed buildings, number of dwellings proposed and flood alleviation;
- Concerns regarding the proposed height being overly dominant and views affected from the footpath;
- Request that parish council's local knowledge and understanding of area is given consideration;
- Request that Historic England are consulted (this is not possible due to Historic England's resource constraints and the size of the development).

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate; the discussion covered the following points:

- New builds will be contained within the site;
- Efficient use of site to the rear, not in open countryside;
- Site large enough to take the proposal;
- Traditional style – materials are essential;
- Culvert welcomed;
- Enabling sensitive refurbishment of listed buildings.

**RESOLVED:** (9 votes to nil)

To grant planning permission for application P15/V2406/FUL, subject to the following conditions:

1. Approved plans.
2. Time limit – three years.
3. Submission of materials (samples).
4. No surface water drainage to highway.
5. Access in accordance with revised plan.
6. Car parking in accordance with revised plan.
7. Gates set back by 6m from carriageway.
8. Turning space in accordance with revised plan.
9. No drainage to highway.
10. Hard and soft landscaping scheme (submission).
11. Landscaping implementation.
12. Surface water drainage in accordance with FRA REV:CV8121204/DB/DW/013.
13. Foul water drainage details.
14. Details of bin stores.
15. Slab levels.
16. Details of flues/vents/extracts and external lighting.

Informative:

Vale Of White Horse District Council – Planning Committee Minutes

Wednesday, 23 March 2016

1. The proposed work to re-open the existing pipe culvert will require a separate land drainage consent application which will require full details of the proposed work.

**RESOLVED:** (9 votes to nil)

To grant listed building consent for application P15/V2407/LB, subject to the following conditions:

1. Time limit three years
2. Approved plans
3. Submission of sample materials/ photo montage of samples.
4. Window and door details.
5. New stair details and heat insulation details for the Granary Barn.
6. Submission of details of lime mortar and limecrete for Granary Barn.
7. Details of flues/vents/extracts and external lighting.

**PI.296 P15/V1319/O - The Lynch, East Hendred, Wantage**

The officer presented the report on application P15/V1319/O for outline application for four detached two storey houses with all matters reserved except access for future determination at The Lynch, East Hendred, Wantage.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Charles Pappenheim, a representative of East Hendred Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application. His concerns included the following:

- Road safety due to the narrow roads without pedestrian access, near to school;
- Impact on the countryside and AONB; and
- Separation between East and West Hendreds;

Terry Gashe, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application. His speech included the following:

- Highways consulted on what the capacity is, which has been followed;
- The primary school supports the application;
- The present boundary of the AONB shows back gardens of The Lynch – the application includes a landscape strip on western boundary to improve the view; and
- There is a need for a variety of housing in the Science Vale area.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate; the discussion covered the following points:

- Useful addition to the village; and
- Impact on the AONB is modest.

**RESOLVED:** (9 votes to nil)

To grant outline planning permission for application P15/V1316/O, subject to the following conditions:

1. Time limit – outline application.
2. Submission of reserved matters.
3. Approved plans.

4. No development to commence until The Lynch is reconstructed to Oxfordshire county council adoptable standards in accordance with details to be submitted and approved.
5. Prior to commencement details of access and visibility to the site from The Lynch to be submitted and approved.
6. Prior to commencement construction traffic management plan to be submitted and approved.
7. Prior to commencement details of landscape strip on western boundary to be submitted and approved.
8. Landscape strip to be implemented in accordance with approved details above.
9. No development to commence until sustainable surface water drainage scheme submitted and approved.
10. Prior to commencement of development foul water drainage strategy to be submitted.

**PI.297      P15/V2934/FUL - Varlins, Halls Lane, East Hanney, Wantage**

The officer presented the report on application P15/V2934/FUL to erect a three bedroom detached dwelling with attached double garage at Varlins, Hall Lane, East Hanney.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

**RESOLVED:** (9 votes to nil)

To grant planning permission for application P15/V2934/FUL, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years - full planning permission.
2. Development to be carried out in accordance with the approved plans.
3. Removal of permitted development rights - garage conversion into accommodation.
4. Access, parking and turning in accordance with the approved plan.
5. No drainage to highway.
6. Submission of materials (samples).
7. Submission of sustainable drainage scheme (full).
8. Submission of details – any vents, flues, extracts and external lighting.
9. Tree protection details to be submitted.
10. Slab levels to be submitted.
11. Landscaping details to be submitted.

**PI.298      P16/V0180/HH - 9 Turnpike Road, Cumnor Hill, Oxford**

The officer presented the report and addendum on application P16/V0180/HH to demolish the existing garage and erect a two-storey side extension at 9 Turnpike Road, Cumnor Hill, Oxford.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Gordon Joyner, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

**RESOLVED:** (7 for; 1 against; 1 abstention)

To grant planning permission for application P16/V0180/HH, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years - full planning permission.
2. Approved plans.
3. Matching materials.
4. Window sill height (extension).
5. Obscured glazing (opening).
6. No drainage to highway.
7. Garage accommodation.

**PI.299 P15/V0719/FUL - Land adjacent to Fieldside, Didcot Road, Harwell**

The officer presented the report on application P15/V0719/FUL to erect a pair of two-storey 4-bed detached dwellings with integral garages served by a shared vehicular access on land adjacent to Fieldside, Didcot Road, Harwell.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

**RESOLVED:** (9 votes to nil)

To grant planning permission for application P15/V0719/FUL, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years - full planning permission.
2. Approved plans.
3. Slab levels to be submitted.
4. Materials details to be submitted.
5. Drainage details to be submitted.
6. Landscaping scheme, including boundary treatments (submission).
7. Landscaping scheme, including boundary treatments (implement).
8. Access, parking and turning in accordance with plan.
9. No gates across access.
10. Garage accommodation to be retained.

**PI.300 P15/V2107/HH - 78 High Street, Milton, Abingdon**

The officer presented the report on application P15/V2107/HH to form habitable rooms in the roof space with rear dormer at 78 High Street, Milton.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Robert Fyfe, a representative of Milton Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

**RESOLVED:** (9 votes to nil)

To grant planning permission for application P15/V2107/HH, subject to the following conditions:

1. Time limit – full permission.
2. Planning condition listing the approved drawings.
3. Materials – details to be submitted.

**PI.301      P16/V0009/A - Land at Abingdon Road, Drayton, Abingdon**

The officer presented the report and addendum on application P16/V0009/A to erect two single sided pole mounted advertisements on land at Abingdon Road, Drayton.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

The committee considered the application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

**RESOLVED:** (7 for; 1 against; 1 abstention)

To grant consent to display advertisement for application P16/V0009/A, subject to the standard advertisement consent conditions.

The meeting closed at 10.10 pm